



How Effective is Ashtakoot Milan in Matching Compatibility?

Dr. S.P. Gaur, Gurgaon

Ashtakoot Milan or Melapak Table is the most popular astro system in North Indian for matching of horoscopes of the boy and the girl intending to marry. It is simple to understand and apply without assistance from any expert. In South India, a more comprehensive and complicated Dashakoot system is followed. Eight factors are considered in Ashtakoot namely 1. Varna 2. Vashya 3. Tara 4. Yoni 5. Graha-Maitri 6. Gana 7. Bhakoot and 8. Nadi. The weightage or Guna allotted to each factor is same as its serial number i.e 1 to 8 and totalling 36 as the maximum score.

In this system only Rashi or Moon charts and birth Nakshatras of the partners are taken into account for assessing the compatibility between them. No importance is attached to the lagna charts, strength of the 7th house, 7th lord and significator of marriage in birth or moon charts, Dashas prevailing, Navmansh chart, natural friendship between lagna or 7th lords in lagna and Navmansh charts strength of other relevant houses and yogas in the birth charts etc. At the best Manglik Dosha is considered and the prevailing popular formula is that a Manglik person be married to a Manglik and a non-Manglik to a non-Manglik. The Guna score ought to be 18 plus that is 50% or more.

Melapak Sarini is freely available in any Panchang or software of astrology. Any layman can read the Guna score and Manglik factor and take a decision on marital compatibility without consulting any astrologer.

Background of the Research Study

In the last few decades, matching of horoscopes of the intending partners has been gaining increasing popularity. There are various reasons for that. Socio-economic scenario has been changing fast. Female folk in our country are no more confined to the homes, completely engaged in tending to their children and be in whole time service to their husbands and the family. They are now going out of their homes like menfolk, doing service jobs of all kinds at par with men and earning equal income. Daily chores of home

are now joint responsibility of both. In cities women enjoy equal social and economic status. In rural hinterland also the changes can be easily noticed though the equality status has not come about. The fallout of this socio-economic equality is the rise of ego factor in mutual relationship Husband can no more dominate or ignore the wishes of his wife the result is ego clash, strifes, quarrels, breaking of relations separation and divorce. Year after year the situation has been deteriorating. Parents are scared. Even the young generation is scared, whether the marriage would be successful, enjoy able or a burden and a forced compromise which no one is sure.

Four five decades ago, matching of horoscopes before marriage was limited and confined to a small percentage of population but now the trend is picking up fast parties only parents were keen for prior matching of horoscopes, now the young and highly educated boys and girls are equally interested in astrological matching.

Objective of the study and strategy

We find that a majority of the general public as well as practicing astrologers are relying upon the Ashtakoot milan system to take a 'yes' or 'no' decision on a marriage proposal. The objective of the research study was to find out.

- Whether the Ashtakoot milan system is efficient and competent to judge compatibility.
- Whether the Guna score is a good guide to determine happiness level in marital relations.
- Whether high score of Gunas gives a high quality of married life and a low score spoils the marriage.
- Whether points need to be added back in case of cancellation of 3 mahadoshas (Gana, Bhakoot, Nadi) for redistic score.
- Whether Guna milan is independently reliable without the need to study other relevant features of the horoscopes.

With the above mentioned objectives in mind, I decided



to have a realistic feed back from those couples who are already married. The only condition was that correct particulars about date of birth, time of birth and place of birth for both are partners should be available. Apart from data available with me, I also got help from my ex-students who are now practicing astrologers themselves. I was able to collect not only the particulars of 200 married couples but their feedback as well about the quality of their married life and major problems, if any, during the first 10 years of their marital life. Based upon the information collected, birth charts and compatability charts were prepared and analysed. My findings with regard to Manglik Dosh, Nadi, Bhakoot and Gana Doshas have already appeared in this research journal. In the present study my endeavour is to assess the utility of the Ashtakoot Milan system versus the actual quality of married life.

The Melapak score was divided into 4 segments namely 0-9, 10-17 and 28-36. The feedback about the quality of married life was divided into 5 groups namely Excellent, Good, Average, Below Average and Bad. It was assumed that Excellent and Good category feedback would indicate highly satisfactory happy married life. The last two categories namely Bad and Below Average would obviously indicate an unsatisfactory or unhappy married life. If Melapak score correctly indicates the health of married life then the parity between quality of marriage and Guna score ought to as follows:

28-36	Guna Score	All Excellent and some Good
18-27	"	Majority of Good and some Average.
10-17	"	Some Avg. & majority of Below Avg.
0-09	"	All Bad and some below Average.

The Ashtakoot Milan tables available in Panchang astrology books and astro softwares do not take into account cancellation of any mahadoshas i.e. Gana, Bhakoot and Nadi and do not make provision to add back the Guna score deducted, if any of them was cancelled, as mentioned in classical muhurta Granthas. Hence I would call such tables as conventional melapak tables.

Results of the study as per conventional Melapak

Guna Score	0-9	10-17	18-27	28-36	Total
Excellent	3	13	45	9	70
Good	4	18	39	5	66
Average	3	10	25	1	39

Below Average	-	5	7	2	14	
Bad	-	3	5	3	11	
Total		10	49	121	20	200

- From the compiled data, we find that 45 cases out of 70 under Excellent category fall under 18-27 bracket instead of 28-36 bracket, where only 9 such cases are recorded.

- Again out 66 cases under Good category, a good majority of 39 cases fall under 18-27 bracket, while only 5 cases fall under 28-36 bracket.

- 13 under Excellent and 18 under Good category have been reported under 10-17 bracket which should have contained majority of Below Average or Average category of cases.

The following table will give a more clear picture where Excellent and Good category cases have been combined along with Bad and Below Average combined separately.

Conventional Melapak Results

Guna Score	Quality of Married Life					
	Excellent + Good		Bad+Below Average		Average	
Bracket	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
28-36	14	10.30	5	20.00	1	2.56
18-27	84	61.76	12	48.00	25	64.10
10-17	31	22.79	8	32.00	10	25.64
0-9	7	5.15	-	-	3	7.70
Total	136	100	25	100	39	100

- One would expect that Excellent and Good marriages would be concentrated largely in 28-36 Guna bracket but reality is that only 10.30% of them fall in this bracket. This is clearly against the spirit of Guna milan system.

- On the otherhand 18-27 bracket contains 61.76% of Excellent and Good marriages. Even 10-17 Guna bracket accounts for 22.79% of happy marriages.

- 80% of the Bad and Below Average or unhappy marriages are also concentrated in 10-17 (32%) and 18-27 (48%) brackets.

- Similarly the Average marriages too are concentrated in 18-27 (64.10%) and 10-17 (25.64%) brackets.

Thus we find that the results as per the conventional Melapak Table do not conform to the actual state of married lives. The 18-27 Guna bracket contains the maximum percentage of all kinds of marriages whether highly successful or highly unsuccessful or even average ones. We are inclined to conclude that

Ashtakoot Guna Milan system as per the conventional Melapak Table given erroneous results contrary to the popular belief.

Revised Melapak Table

As already mentioned the conventional Malapak Table does not take into account cancellation of three Mahadoshas namely Nadi, Bhakoot and Gana Doshas. If any of them gets cancelled, its Gunas are not added back to the total.

The basis for a revised Melapak is also repeatedly mentioned in our Muhurta Granthas. If the Rashi lords of the bride and bridegroom are mutual friends or if the same planet happens to be Rashi lord of the both, then all kinds of Ashtakoot Doshas are destroyed including the three Mahadoshas. Some of such relevant shlokas are given hereunder :

न वर्ग वर्णो न गणो न योनिः द्विंदादशे चैव षडष्टके वा ।
तारा विरोधे नव पंचमे ना मैत्री यदास्याच्छुभदो विवाहः ॥
—वृहज्ज्योतिषसार

न वर्ण वर्गो न गणो न योनिर्द्विंदादशे चैव षडष्टके वा ।
वरेऽपि दूरे नवपंचमे वा मैत्री यदि स्याच्छुभदो विवाहः ॥
—ज्योतिर्निबन्ध

नाडी विवेद्ये यदि स्याद्विवाह करोति वैधव्य युतां च कन्याम् ।
स एव माहेन्द्र—दिनादि युक्तो राशीश—योनि सहितो न दोषः ॥
—वसिष्ठ संहिता

राशीशयोः सुहृदभावे मित्रत्वे वांशनाथयोः ।
गणादिदौष्ट्येऽप्युद्वाह पुत्र—पौत्र विवर्धनः ॥
—अत्रि

अभिदुरावधिपौ सृजतः शुभंशशशि नवांशकयोरिति देवलः ।
—विवाह वृन्दावन

न खेट मैत्रं नो वश्य न वर्णो न च तारकाः ।
सद्भकूटे परा प्रीतिर्न सा वज्रेण भिद्यते ॥
योनौ गणे चैत्वनुकूलता स्याच्छुभो ।
विवाहो ह्यपि खैट वैरं ॥
—ज्योतिर्निबन्ध

विभैक चरणे भिन्नर्क्षं राश्यैककम् ।
भिन्नागधयेकभमेतयोर्गण खगौ नाडी नृदूरंचतः ॥
—मुहूर्तमार्तण्ड

पराशरः ग्राह नवांश भेदादेकर्क्षं राशयोरपि सौमनस्यम् ।
—विवाह वृन्दावन

All the above shlokas point out cancellation of various Doshas of Ashtakoot milan and particularly lay stress

on mutual friendship of Rashi lords or same planet being Rashi lord in both the horoscopes, resulting into cancellation of all kinds of minor and major doshas.

एक राशि पृथक्धिष्येऽप्युत्तमं पणिपीडनम् ।
एकधिष्ये पृथग्राषौ, सर्वैक्टोऽपि मृत्युदम् ॥
—वसिष्ठ संहिता

The above shloka states that there is no cancellation of Nadi Dosha when same Nakshatra and same charan are involved. In that case Navmansha Rashis will also be same.

The conventional Melapak tables or popular astro softwares for matching do not take into consideration the above mentioned cancellation factors for reasons best known to them. But this negligence has been causing lot of damage to the innocent public who are solely relying on the Melapak table in vogue for marriage compatibility decisions. A rough guess is that 18 Gunas (i.e. 50%) would have crossed the passing marks limit and resulted into marriage alliance.

Recompilation of Results

The cancellation or parihar conditions as mentioned in the shlokas quoted above, clearly stipulate that all kinds of Doshas get nullified if the Rashi lords are mutual friends or both the partners have the same planet as Rashi lord.

I recompiled the results and added back the full points of Gana, Bhakoot nad Nadi Doshas wherever the cancellation conditions were met. Other Doshas were not touched because in the conventional malapak also. There was provision to allow or deduct a part of the total Gunas allotted to each koot from varna to Graha maitri depending upon the severity of the dosha.

Revised Melapak Results

Guna Score	0-9	10-17	18-27	28-36	Total
Quality of Married life					
Excellent	2	4	16	48	70
Good	3	5	14	44	66
Average	2	3	14	20	39
Below Average	-	3	7	4	14
Bad	-	-	2	9	11
Total	7	15	53	125	200

• Now we find distinct changes compared to the results of conventional melapak. Out of 70 Excellent



cases, 48 fall into 28-36 Guna bracket compared to only 9 cases earlier. Similarly the Good marriage number has increased from 5 to 44 under 28-36 bracket.

- Under 18-27 Guna bracket the Excellent cases have reduced from 45 to 16 and under Good category the number has reduced from 25 to 14.
- Similarly significant fall is noticed under 10-17 bracket for Excellent and Good categories, the reduction being from 13 to 4 and from 18 to 5 respectively. Under Average category however the 28-36 bracket has the number increased from just 1 case to 20 cases now.

The picture would be more clear from the following table where Excellent and Good categories are merged for successful marriages and Bad and Below Average categories merged together for unsuccessful marriages.

Revised Melapak Score

Guna Score	Quality of Married Life					
	Excellent +Good		Bad+Below Average		Average	
Bracket	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
28-36	92	67.65	13	52.00	20	51.28
18-27	30	22.06	9	36.00	14	35.90
10-17	9	6.62	3	12.00	3	7.69
0-9	5	3.67	-	-	2	5.13
Total	136	100	25	100	39	100

- Under 28-36 Guna bracket, for Excellent and Good category marriages the percentage has gone up from just 10.30% in conventional Malapak to 67.25% in revised Melapak.
- Under 18-27 bracket percentage of Excellent nad Good marriages stands reduced from 61.76% earlier to 22.06% now.
- A similar trend is observed under 10-17 bracket, where the percentage of Excellent and Good marriage is reduced from 22.79% to 6.62%.

The above pattern is in consonance with the spirit of Ashtakoot Milan system namely that the 28-36 bracket should contain the maximum or majority of highly successful marriages.

But the same is not true for unsuccessful marriages contained in Bad and Below Average categories. Under 28-36 bracket such cases have increased from 5 to 13 and under 18-27 bracket such cases are reduced from 12 to 9.

Conclusion

- The conventional Melapak table gives erroneous results against the spirit of Ashtakoot Milan system. The basic reason for the faulty results is that there is no provision to add back the points allotted to Gana, Bhaikoot and Nadi koots when such doshas get cancelled.
- The revised Melapak gives a far better picture close to the real life situation. The revised melapak is based upon the principle that all Doshas get nullified when the Rashi lords are mutual friends or same planet happens to be Rashi lord in the charts of both the bride and bridegroom.
- Even the revised Melapak is not perfect because while highly successful marriages move to higher Guna brackets, simultaneously unsuccessful marriages also move to higher Guna brackets.
- My rough guess is that while the conventional melapak gives 40% realistic results, the revised melapak's accuracy goes up to 70%. Therefore there is an urgent need to revise the existing Melapak for the benefit of the general public as well as the practising astrologers.
- Never the less only Ashtakoot Milan should not be the deciding factor for marriage compatability. It would give misleading results.

We must give prime importance to analysis of horoscopes, Navamansh charts, 7th house, other related houses and planets for marital happiness as well as the current and forth coming Doshas, for holistic appraisal of marital compatability.

A word of caution is necessary for the general public or laymen, who do not have even the basic knowledge of astrology. Guna Milan score alone is not at all reliable for marriage compatability. It is only one of the several factors to be looked into. Neither it is the most important factor. Melapak score is not a dependable substitute for a competent astrologer's advice.

Finally I would like to appeal to the experts and advisors making softwares or Panchangs containing Melapak tables that immediate steps be taken to revise the marriage compatability tables. at least comprehensive studies can be initiated by serious students of astrology and renowned astrologers opinion can be sought on the results of such studies so that an ideal revised Melapak Table be prepared and popularised sooner than later. This would check the damage being caused to the public at large due to a faulty conventional Melapak table and uphold the good image of astrology.